



*Routledge Science and Religion Series*

# **AGAINST METHODOLOGY IN SCIENCE AND RELIGION**

**RECENT DEBATES ON RATIONALITY AND THEOLOGY**

Josh Reeves



# Against Methodology in Science and Religion

Since its development as a field over the last part of the twentieth century, scholars in science and religion have been heavily concerned with methodological issues. Following the lead of Thomas Kuhn, many scholars in this interdisciplinary field have offered proposals that purport to show how theology and science are compatible by appropriating theories of scientific methodology or rationality. Arguing against this strategy, this book shows why much of this methodological work is at odds with recent developments in the history and philosophy of science and should be reconsidered.

First, three influential methodological proposals are critiqued: Lakatosian research programs, Alister McGrath's *Scientific Theology*, and the post-foundationalist project of Wentzel van Huyssteen. Each of these approaches is shown to have a common failing: the idea that science has an essential nature, with features that unite "scientific" or even "rational" inquiry across time or disciplines. After outlining the issues this failing could have on the viability of the field, the book concludes by arguing that there are several ways scholarship in science and religion can move forward, even if the terms "science" and "religion" do not refer to something universally valid or philosophically useful.

This is a bold study of the methodology of science and religion that pushes both subjects to consider the other more carefully. As such, it will be of great interest to scholars in religious studies, theology, and the philosophy of science.

**Josh Reeves** is Assistant Professor of Science and Religion at Samford University, USA. Having run the New Directions in Science and Religion project, he has also written multiple articles on science and religion for peer-reviewed journals and is a coauthor of *A Little Book for New Scientists* (2016).

## **Routledge Science and Religion Series**

Series editors:

*Michael S. Burdett, Wycliffe Hall, University of Oxford, UK*

*Mark Harris, University of Edinburgh, UK*

Science and religion have often been thought to be at loggerheads, but much contemporary work in this flourishing interdisciplinary field suggests this is far from the case. The Science and Religion Series presents exciting new work to advance interdisciplinary study, research, and debate across key themes in science and religion. Contemporary issues in philosophy and theology are debated, as are prevailing cultural assumptions. The series enables leading international authors from a range of different disciplinary perspectives to apply the insights of the various sciences, theology, philosophy, and history in order to look at the relations between the different disciplines and the connections that can be made between them. These accessible, stimulating new contributions to key topics across science and religion, will appeal particularly to individual academics and researchers, graduates, postgraduates, and upper-undergraduate students.

### **Being as Communion**

A Metaphysics of Information

*William A. Dembski*

### **The Roots of Religion**

Exploring the Cognitive Science of Religion

*Edited by Roger Trigg and Justin L. Barrett*

### **The Intelligent Design Debate and the Temptation of Scientism**

*Erkki Vesa Rope Kojonen*

### **Science and the Truthfulness of Beauty**

How the Personal Perspective Discovers Creation

*Robert Gilbert*

### **Against Methodology in Science and Religion**

Recent Debates on Rationality and Theology

*Josh Reeves*

For more information and a full list of titles in the series, please visit: <https://www.routledge.com/religion/series/ASCIREL>

# Against Methodology in Science and Religion

Recent Debates on Rationality  
and Theology

Josh Reeves

First published 2019  
by Routledge  
2 Park Square, Milton Park, Abingdon, Oxon OX14 4RN

and by Routledge  
711 Third Avenue, New York, NY 10017

*Routledge is an imprint of the Taylor & Francis Group, an informa  
business*

© 2019 Josh Reeves

The right of Josh Reeves to be identified as author of this work  
has been asserted by him in accordance with sections 77 and 78 of  
the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reprinted or  
reproduced or utilised in any form or by any electronic, mechanical,  
or other means, now known or hereafter invented, including  
photocopying and recording, or in any information storage or  
retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publishers.

*Trademark notice:* Product or corporate names may be trademarks  
or registered trademarks, and are used only for identification and  
explanation without intent to infringe.

*British Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data*

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British  
Library

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Reeves, Josh A., 1976– author.

Title: Against methodology in science and religion : recent debates  
on rationality and theology / Josh Reeves.

Description: Abingdon, Oxon ; New York, NY : Routledge,  
2019. | Series: Routledge science and religion series | Includes  
bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018027268 (print) | LCCN 2018030787 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Religion and science—Methodology.

Classification: LCC BL240.3 (ebook) |

LCC BL240.3 .R4338 2018 (print) | DDC 201/.65—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2018027268>

ISBN: 978-1-138-47794-0 (hbk)

ISBN: 978-1-351-10377-0 (ebk)

Typeset in Sabon  
by codeMantra



# Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	xi
<b>1 Introduction: on making theology “scientific”</b>	<b>1</b>
<i>Introduction: what makes science unique?</i>	1
<i>Outline of the book</i>	4
<b>2 Methodology and the field of science and religion</b>	<b>8</b>
<i>Introduction</i>	8
<i>The ideal of method</i>	9
<i>Science as an apologetic foundation</i>	11
<i>Post-Kuhnian philosophy of science</i>	15
<i>Thomas Kuhn and the making comparisons         between science and religion</i>	17
<i>Conclusion</i>	22
<b>3 The Lakatosian Program of Nancey Murphy</b>	<b>29</b>
<i>Introduction</i>	29
<i>Philosophy of Imre Lakatos</i>	30
Lakatos and Karl Popper	30
Popper/Kuhn debate	31
Methodology of scientific research programs	33
Appraising research programs	34
Lakatos and the history of science	35
<i>Murphy and Lakatos</i>	38
Appropriating Lakatos	38
Applying Lakatos to theology	40
<i>Evaluation of Lakatos</i>	42
Appraising research programs	42
Lakatos and the history of science	44

<b>4</b>	<b>Alister McGrath's <i>Scientific Theology</i></b>	<b>56</b>
	<i>Introduction</i>	56
	<i>Between enlightenment foundationalism and postmodernity</i>	57
	<i>Science and critical realism</i>	58
	<i>Critical realism and Christian theology</i>	60
	<i>Different methods for a stratified reality</i>	61
	<i>Theology as grounding science</i>	62
	<i>Evaluation of McGrath's critical realism</i>	63
	What does the miracle argument prove?	63
	Is critical realism a consistent position?	65
	Local vs global realism	68
	<i>Conclusion</i>	71
<b>5</b>	<b>The postfoundationalist project of J. Wentzel Van Huyssteen</b>	<b>76</b>
	<i>Introduction</i>	76
	Modernity and postmodernity	77
	<i>The postfoundationalist model</i>	79
	Evolutionary origins of rationality	80
	Rationality as an epistemic skill	81
	The pursuit of intelligibility	82
	Transversal rationality	83
	Experiential adequacy	84
	Problem-solving and research traditions	85
	Comparing science and religion	87
	Evaluation of postfoundationalism	88
	What is Enlightenment?	88
	Postfoundationalism and theological legitimacy	92
	<i>Conclusion</i>	96
<b>6</b>	<b>Anti-essentialism and the history of science</b>	<b>101</b>
	<i>Introduction</i>	101
	<i>The traditional interpretation of the Scientific Revolution</i>	102
	Isaac Newton: culmination of the Scientific Revolution	105
	<i>Revising the traditional interpretation</i>	106
	Isaac Newton: theologian, alchemist, and natural philosopher	110
	<i>Conclusion: four lessons from the history of science</i>	111

Isaac Newton: theologian, alchemist, and natural philosopher	110
<i>Conclusion: four lessons from the history of science</i>	111
<b>7 Anti-essentialism and the future of the field of science and religion</b>	<b>122</b>
<i>Summary of argument</i>	122
<i>Anti-essentialism in philosophy of science</i>	124
<i>The territories of science and religion</i>	126
<i>Implications for the future of the field of science and religion</i>	128
Science and religion scholars as “Historians of the Present”	129
Embedding science and religion scholars in research programs	131
Reform the categories of <i>science</i> and <i>religion</i>	133
<i>Conclusion</i>	136
 <i>Index</i>	 141